DIGGING THE YOUTUBE VLOGGING IMPACT ON ENHANCING STUDENTS' SPEAKING PROFICIENCY

Edeltrudis Patrisia Soge¹, Wendelinus Oscar Janggo², Marta Alinda³

English Language Education Study Program of Nusa Nipa University
patriciasoge1819@gmail.com¹, oscarjanggo@gmail.com², martaAlinda87@gmail.com³

Abstract:
In this study, the authors implemented Classroom Action Research by using Youtube vlogging to improve students' speaking proficiency in two cycles. The primary objectives of this study were to describe the implementation of using this media and to find out how much students' speaking proficiency improved. Observations, interviews, field notes, documentation, and speaking tests were used in collecting the data. The authors evaluated the English test results of each student for data analysis. The samples of this study were twenty students of X-E-1 (tenth grade) of SMAK.ST. Gabriel Maumere. Quantitative data were collected from test scores, while qualitative data were collected from the progress of student activities, pleasant classroom atmosphere and interesting learning environment. The average score in the pre-test was 50.6%, with only 25% success rate in class percentages. During the first cycle, eight students (40%) reached the minimum standard of criteria, resulting in an average class score of 65.1%. In the second cycle, 17 students (85%) exceeded the standard, and the class average increased significantly to 77.4%. Consequently, it can be deduced that creating Youtube vlogs can augment students' spoken proficiency.

Key Terms: Speaking proficiency, Youtube vlogging, classroom action research

INTRODUCTION

Incorporating technology and the internet within education is crucial in order to equip students with the necessary skills for the future. According to Harmer in Kartini et al. (2021), English's role as a lingua franca has made it extensively used by many citizens worldwide. As an international language, English plays a crucial role in global information exchange. Consequently, English learning has been implemented for several decades and is widely practised in almost every country globally. However, according to Nishanthi (2018) every region worldwide has its language, which is regarded as a national language. English can be the first, foreign, or second language in the process of acquiring a language.

Dealing with teaching English language, students are expected to enhance their competencies in listening, reading, writing, and speaking. Susini and Ndruru (2021) argue that to attain proficiency in English, students must acquaint themselves with fundamental English skills, i.e., listening, speaking, reading, and writing. Among these skills, speaking holds the highest significance in learning English. Speaking is an essential skill that students must acquire to effectively communicate in society. Hence, it holds a greater value than other competencies. The act of speaking facilitates the transmission of messages from the speaker to the listener, enabling the latter to comprehend the content (Mustikawati in Afrilliani, 2020). Speaking is an essential skill that students must acquire to effectively communicate in society. Furthermore, speaking enables individuals to express their intentions, making communication
clearer and more comprehensible. Communication involves the delivery of information, either directly or indirectly. One must be able to listen and speak to effectively deliver and receive information. Speaking, however, is not as straightforward as it may seem. Students must master a range of linguistic skills such as pronunciation, vocabulary, grammar, fluency, and comprehension, making learning English for speaking purposes more challenging. In everyday situations, using language through spoken communication is twice as common as using reading and writing. By mastering speaking skill, the students will be able to communicate in English with other people from other countries easily (Liwun & Alinda, 2021).

The significant difficulty encountered in teaching English to students is the insufficient knowledge of students demonstrated by their passive classroom involvement. Sönmez (Misesani, 2020) highlights the objective of the needs analysis as identifying the student’s needs and defining the target language teaching to effectively develop a curriculum. Needs analysis has turned out to be one of the fundamental aspects of English language teaching, mainly during the material creation process. In this situation, teachers must analyse the student’s condition and the school environment objectively. This demands that educators think critically while formulating a media, strategy, or game that facilitates comprehension and enhances the students' competence in speaking English. Therefore, a concerted effort towards maximising the use of technology to improve students' skills is imperative.

One way to enhance English language proficiency in students is by utilising technology, specifically smartphones. Nowadays, an increasing number of young people are using smartphones to produce content. Popular platforms that reach all demographics include Youtube and Video Blog (Vlog), as Youtube offers a plethora of content, such as music, videos, podcasts, educational materials, and more (Jalaluddin, 2016). By using Youtube, individuals can easily create an account and generate appealing content such as video blogs. Therefore, integrating such content in language lessons can make learning more enjoyable. Video blogs typically provide explanations on various topics (Gunelius, 2021).

On the other hand, according to Jung and Lee in Putri (2019), 90% of 18-24 year olds utilise the platform, with 36% of them watching television programmes, movies, instructional videos and other clips on a daily basis. Youtube offers a range of videos within various categories, such as personal, educational, entertainment, and commercial. Students can access educational video content that matches their preferred learning style and specific skillset requirements. Students can enjoy an entertaining viewing experience while learning English, as every video on Youtube has unique features that capture their interests. Furthermore, Kartini & Jubhari (2021) advocates for the integration of technology as an aid in learning, highlighting the effectiveness of technological media, such as videos, in enhancing speaking proficiency and active engagement among students in the English classroom. It also presents an avenue for teachers to employ mechanics, aesthetics, and game thinking in motivating, engaging, and teaching students to resolve problems.

Vlogs have revolutionised the use of multimedia, making them an interesting and engaging tool for students to learn from. The term "vlog" is an abbreviation of "video blog," describing a video-based platform developed from traditional written blogs. Creating vlogs involves making videos or notes in an event to subsequently post online. During its inception, vlogs were erroneously referred to as podcasts, as it was a term used to describe the merging of audio and video blogs. The term has since evolved and taken on its own unique characteristics, (Combe & Codreanu, 2016). A vlog is a type of video diary that is regularly updated and shared publicly through a private channel on a video-sharing platform, such as Youtube. Some vlogs focus on a particular topic, such as travel, beauty or gaming, while others offer a more general commentary on life and current events. Additionally, according to Lestari (2019), video blogging or vlog has advantages over traditional text-based blogging, as it combines video, sound, pictures and text to provide increased content, context and information, evoking greater emotional engagement and facilitating sharing among users.
This kind of topic has been examined in prior studies. Sari et al. (2019) conducted research to establish anxiety levels among non-native English students while completing a Youtube video project. Retrieved from Hamuddin et al. (2020) carried out a study to assess the efficacy of artificial intelligence applications in an English as a Foreign Language (EFL) classroom. Furthermore, Latief and et al. (2020) examined the topic of interest to evaluate the influence of online games on English language acquisition. The article seeks to demonstrate the efficiency of machine translation in processing language supplied by technology. This report analyses the benefits and drawbacks of utilising Google Translate (GT) in the cultural context of Indonesia. Hereinafter, the research executed by Apriyanti et al. (2018) with the goal of improving students' public speaking abilities through Instagram. The Encore, a research applied by Ahmed et al. (2022). The article investigated the efficacy of Duolingo and WhatsApp applications in improving the accuracy and fluency of spoken English among Iranian EFL students.

In light of this research, it is important to note both the similarity and the difference between the previous studies and the present study. Both this research and preceding studies concentrate on students' speaking skills, Nevertheless, the objects of the research are quite different. The initial study investigates students' speaking anxiety regarding the YouTube video project used in EFL education in Indonesia, while the second study explores students' speaking performance with the aid of Lyra Virtual Assistance. Additionally, the third study analyses the utilisation of machine translation systems in cultural contexts, and the final study assesses the influence of Instagram on students' public speaking abilities. Similarly significant, the fifth research analyses the impact of Duolingo and WhatsApp apps on the precision and fluency of spoken language. On the other hand, this research concentrates on the practical incorporation of Youtube vlogging into the English language learning and teaching processes in a secondary school in the eastern Indonesia, where its utilisation as a support system for English language learning is still extremely rare, leaving learners quite behind in exploiting technologies likely to enrich their English language skills.

**METHOD**

In order to improve the quality of education, this study used the Classroom Action Research (CAR) method. CAR is an action research approach in the education sector that implements particular measures to augment the teaching and learning process, resulting in enhanced learning outcomes. The method initiates with investigations into experiences, challenges, or difficulties faced in the classroom, as per the findings of Yumelking et al. (2020). This study entails a reflective approach that permits educators to appraise different facets of teaching and learning objectively. As well as according to Kemmis in Asiyah (2023), classroom action research is a kind of reflective and communal research executed by researchers in social settings to enhance the rationale of their social practice. Consequently, the approach results in amendments that heighten academic outcomes. Initial usage of technical term abbreviations will be clarified. The customary academic sections will be incorporated and standard author and institutional formatting will be upheld. The study was carried out following Yuniar et al.'s (2021) guidelines, which employed Kemmis and McTaggart's framework featuring four stages: planning, acting, observing, and reflecting. It was retrieved from 27 August to 27 October 2023 with a group of twenty students from Class X-E-1 of SMAK St Gabriel Maumere, a private Catholic Senior high school.

The study used various methods for data gathering such as observations, interviews, field notes, documentation, and speaking tests. The authors evaluated the English test results of each student for data analysis. The authors conducted two cycles of the procedure, each with four stages, within a 90-minute interval. The questionnaire, interview, and tool pre-tests were conducted to ascertain the tool's comprehensibility among respondents, thereby validating it (Sileyew, 2019). An oral presentation served as the speaking assessment, where students were prompted to deliver a concise presentation on a pre-planned or spontaneously assigned topic.
Both quantitative and qualitative data were analyzed for results. Qualitative data were utilised in explaining the teaching process, whereas quantitative data were implemented to analyze the student’s performance, incorporating speaking exam results to gather and assess this information.

Students were provided comprehensive information about the aims, methods, potential hazards, and benefits of the study within the informed consent process. It was clearly stated that participants were free to decline participation without any adverse outcomes. Furthermore, each participant was issued a consent form delineating the purpose, data collection, and analysis methods of the study. Upon completing the opt-out form, participants confirmed their intention to participate and their awareness of the complexities of the research (Ginting, 2022). Adequate opportunities were afforded to the participants to comprehend the information presented, and they were prompted to raise queries concerning any ambiguities before consenting to participate.

To assess the speaking ability of students with the use of YouTube Vlogging, the author followed specific steps. Firstly, a clarification of YouTube Vlogging was provided. Next, students were given the freedom to choose their desired topic and elaborate on it using descriptive language. The selection of this topic was based on the Common European Framework of Reference (CEFR). The CEFR offers a comprehensive representation of a student’s abilities and serves as a guide for principals, syllabus makers, teachers, and students (Efendi, 2021). It consists of six levels that evaluate the student's proficiency levels. Furthermore, students generate videos that can be effortlessly uploaded to their respective YouTube channels. YouTube vlogging can be conducted through a series of steps, including preparing and rehearsing the transcript, setting up the recording equipment, filming the video, editing the footage, and publishing it on the youtube channel, Tristiana and Swondo (2020). In order to achieve a polished speaking performance, students are required to generate a script that accurately describes a subject and utilizes appropriate language.

FINDINGS

Pre-cycle

During this phase of the orientation to the school environment, the author observed the process of English teaching and learning activities in the classroom, interviewed English teachers and students about their experiences in terms of both challenges and successes, their perspectives on the atmosphere during the English teaching and learning process, their arguments for the use of Youtube Vlogging media in English learning, and administered a simple test. Observation revealed that students in Class X-E-1 at SMAK ST. Gabriel Maumere showed less enthusiasm in learning the English language. The students contended that 1.) the English teaching and learning process was boring and uninspiring. 2.) They are perplexed and prefer to communicate in Indonesian rather than English. 3.) Although smartphones are permitted, students lack expertise about how to use them effectively to enhance their English study. 4.) Because they didn't have an internet subscription, it was tough to learn from them. 5.) The materials' examples were unfamiliar to them. 6.) They are more active and prefer the environment of learning activities outside the school to that of learning activities inside the classroom since the interior environment is less favorable. 7.) Smart students frequently dominate in answering teacher-posed questions.

Conversely, interviews with English teachers discovered that 1.) the majority of students struggle to comprehend the supplied information considering a lack of enthusiasm in English courses. 2.) When presenting arguments about the provision of teaching resources, students have difficulty expressing themselves or communicating in English. 3.) English teachers as educators are suboptimal in terms of technology adoption and usage of contextual instructional resources. 4.) Students' perceptions of the difficulty of learning English have been shaped. 5.) Students often lack the confidence required to participate fully in the learning
process. As it turns out, the classroom environment suffers because the teacher is the only source of activity.

To assess the student’s English proficiency, the authors constantly conduct English pronunciation practices, listening tests, and writing tests. During the listening and writing tests, students demonstrated enough ability, but in contrast, their speaking ability showed low scores both individually and classically. No one achieved the success criteria for speaking ability. Based on the observations and interviews conducted, it seems that urging students to work harder is not feasible. Instead, they require a more enjoyable learning experience using current technology. Following a pre-test on 23 October 2023, only 25% of the 20 participating students met the minimum completeness criteria, with only 5 achieving scores above the requisite level. The mean score total was 50.6. After examining the test results produced by the students, the author implemented Cycle I. This involved utilizing YouTube Vlogging as a means of capturing student attention towards English language learning and enhancing their spoken language proficiency.

Cycle I

At this phase, the authors looked at the enactment of the action and the findings of the observation. Subsequently, the authors considered ways of amending the action to encourage the students to confidently speak in English, notwithstanding their limited mobility, through the medium of YouTube vlogging. The aim is to provide students with new introductions and experiences of technological developments in the world of education. Using this medium, students are given different situations, spaces and times to speak freely outside the classroom without any pressure. Two cycles, each lasting 90 minutes, were conducted as part of this research. The author monitored all activities in the classroom. Some students displayed interest, recording videos of themselves and uploading them onto their individual YouTube accounts. However, others showed less interest.

Furthermore, students exhibit inadequate motivation and self-assurance when vocalising and describing a topic via vlogs. Students also struggled to articulate their thoughts because of their limited vocabulary. The results of the English test indicated that merely 40% or 7 students out of 20 met the criteria for completion, with the mean score of the whole class being only 65.1%. Observing and analysing the results of this phase, the authors contemplated redesigning the strategies employed to foster competence in speaking proficiency for the subsequent cycle. In regards to the reflection stage, there are several areas for improvement identified by the authors. Firstly, it is essential to improve the teaching technique to establish a positive learning environment. Secondly, it is important for the researcher to provide students with the chance to ask questions and clarify their learning objectives. Thirdly, the authors recommended students to utilize a dictionary, online or offline. Lastly, a clear explanation of the process for implementing Youtube vlogging is crucial. While pursuing the independent curriculum's teaching module, the authors did not provide an adequate and intelligible elucidation of the subject matter through their YouTube vlogging medium. Therefore, following an analysis of the students' average scores and the observations, interviews, and questionnaires collected during post-test Cycle I held on 26th October 2023, the researcher identified the need to conduct further action research in Cycle II.

Cycle II

The second phase consisted of two 90-minute sessions during which the author observed all classroom activities. It was concluded that the students were engagingly articulate while discussing and expressing their respective opinions. The author observed every activity in the classroom and concluded that students actively availed themselves to discuss and express their opinions. Consequently, the students demonstrated enhanced enthusiasm for participation.
The author observed every activity in the classroom and concluded that students actively availed themselves to discuss and express their opinions. The meeting in this stage transpired as anticipated, owing to the teacher's unambiguous directives on YouTube vlogging and comprehensive elaboration of descriptive text elements. The students' proficiency in the new topic appears to have significantly improved. This is demonstrated by their use of new vocabulary, accurate pronunciation, and enhanced English speaking abilities, surpassing their previous performance. The authors and English teacher were content with the success of their efforts to increase student's confidence and speaking performance. The increase in the number of students who satisfied the completion criteria of 77.4% and the class percentage score of 85% presents substantiation for this proposition. Additionally, the implementation of the YouTube vlogging process witnessed active engagement, enthusiasm, and cooperation of students, disclosed through observation sheets, interviews, and questionnaires.

The success criteria were met by the second cycle post-test held on 28th October 2023, based on the research instruments provided. Despite this achievement, the authors and English teacher at the school decided to withdraw the classroom action research because they were successful in enhancing students' speaking performance through YouTube vlogging, which was part of the previously discussed plan.

DISCUSSION

Class activities that utilize Youtube vlogging should aim to improve students' ability to engage with the target language for practical purposes. This can be achieved by utilizing technology with a focus on the messages being communicated. In this case, the English performance to be achieved is how students are able to express and describe something as fluently as when speaking Indonesian. There were many shortcomings in confidence, vocabulary selection, pronunciation and speaking performance when recording themselves.

During observation, it was uncovered that all tenth grade classes in this school are utilizing the independent curriculum. This requires educators to optimize the use of technology and adapt teaching materials and techniques to suit the varying learning styles of students, be they visual, auditory, or kinesthetic learners. Each student presents a unique approach to learning based on their individual abilities. According to Niga and Janggo (2022), differentiated learning is an essential component within modern educational practices. It is widely acknowledged among educational professionals that instructional materials should be adapted or 'differentiated' to cater for students with specific learning needs, regardless of their areas of strength or weakness.

Following interviews with 20 students, it was determined that 50% (10 students) possess a visual learning style, 25% (5 students) exhibit an auditory learning style, and another 25% (5 students) demonstrated a kinesthetic learning style. It was found that the use of YouTube was not favoured by 15 students (75%) due to various factors such as lack of internet packages, lack of proficiency in utilizing YouTube to enhance speaking skills and discomfort and lack of confidence in recording and uploading themselves. Additionally, a stigma exists that YouTube only contains negative content. On the other hand, 3 students (15%) enjoyed using YouTube to watch their favourite movies. None of the students had ever used YouTube to upload self-recorded videos. The findings of this interview provide additional incentive for the author to devise a method for pupils to develop their proficiency in English through the use of YouTube vlogging.

As part of the implementation of YouTube vlogging, students are presented with an extensive platform to utilise smartphones in the pursuit of technological advancement. The process is structured in the following manner. Firstly, the authors assess the students' initial comprehension by providing an explanation concerning YouTube vlogging. At this stage, the students are instructed on creating a YouTube channel and uploading their individual videos content. Before using YouTube vlogging, students were tasked with presenting on a different topic in front of the class. At the start of the first cycle, students were introduced to description
text and in the second session, students were required to record themselves explaining a free topic aligned with CEFR (The Common European Framework of Reference). In the light of the first cycle's reflective process, the author determined to proceed with the second cycle. In the light of the first cycle's reflective process, the author determined to proceed with the second cycle. During the first meeting of the latter, the author provided a more profound understanding of the material via improved teaching methods. In the following session, students were tasked with recording a video that explained a new topic. In the light of the first cycle's reflective process, the author determined to proceed with the second cycle. Aspects common to both cycles were that students had to compose a script and deliver a presentation. The students dispersed to locate a comfortable environment to record their personal video. Students are prompted to focus on their individual learning process and develop appropriate techniques for self-directed study. It is crucial to establish an environment that fosters active participation, which can be accomplished by offering structured chances for students to express their viewpoints, concepts, and perceptions. Such measures can aid in fostering self-assurance and equipping learners with vital competencies in critical analysis and effective communication.

The study satisfied the success criteria within two cycles. According to the pre-test results, just 5 students (25%) accomplished the minimum pass criteria, whereas the remaining 15 (75%) failed to do so. The class presentation score was only 25% and the class average score was only 50.6%. Then, the Cycle 1 post-test showed that there was an improvement in the students' speaking skills when using YouTube vlogging, although it was still low. There were 7 students (35%) who met the success criteria. The class presentation was 40% and the average class score was 65.1%. Although the first cycle showed improvement, this cycle cannot be considered successful. To address this issue, the educator-authors initiated the lesson with an engaging introduction to pique students' interest in learning. They also clarified the course content in a clear and efficient manner to cultivate a productive classroom environment and allowed students to ask questions and attain learning goals through the use of various media. This approach motivates students to develop their English communication skills, particularly in expressing their viewpoints and ideas. Offering encouragement and a positive outlook to motivate students is linked with their active involvement in learning (Ginting, 2021). Afterwards, the researcher was satisfied because the efforts to improve the students' speaking skills had been realised. This was shown by the significant results of the second cycle, where the class average increased to 77.4% and the overall class presentation reached a total of 85%.

Throughout the teaching and learning activities, particularly during the cycle implementation, the author, acting as the teacher, consistently provided clear and engaging explanations while delivering feedback on the students' progress and offering in-depth motivation. The style used was interesting and less formal to ensure optimal comprehension. All of this was delivered in English, where in stages the author provided experiences so that students were accustomed to hearing conversations, or expressions of sentences in English. The author also gave the students the opportunity to "guess" and "translate" the meaning based on their ability through the English dictionary. At times, the author often uses body movements to sharpen the student's brains.

In this regard, the results of the interviews, questionnaires and observation sheets also evidenced a high level of involvement, engagement and cohesion of the students in the vlogging learning process. This is demonstrated by the results of the questionnaire, which indicated nearly all the students (90%) seemed interested in gaining the courage to record themselves speaking and learning English through the medium of YouTube vlogging, understood the instructions well, and considered the game successful. The English teacher appreciated the incorporation of YouTube vlogging in teaching and learning activities. They stated that it is an intriguing avenue for students to learn English as it provides the chance to explore quotes beyond the classroom and encourages self-recording. The utilization of this medium as a pedagogical tool promotes creative thinking and communication skills.

The students were motivated to locate a suitable setting, choose a topic, and explore it autonomously. The authors acted solely as facilitators who offered guidance, while the students...
undertook all video recording tasks independently. Some initially reserved students found their voice and spoke up, though volume was lacking, and previously reticent students uncovered fresh ideas that enhanced their oral proficiency. Their confidence is slowly increasing towards the abilities that students are expected to achieve. On the author's observation, it was noted that students assisted one another in recording videos of their fellow classmates. This increased the liveliness of the learning environment, albeit noisier. However, this commotion was not disruptive but rather created an environment conducive to producing the best vlog.

Each lesson in the cycle concluded with the students feeling one step closer to their goal. The students' successful demonstration of their English performance skills through Youtube vlogging was aided by the author's strategic adjustments. This necessitates the authors to have a good grip on the study material, be proficient in technology, and accommodate to the learning setting and student needs. The authors provide assessment methods to measure the students' progress via practicing, exercises, and tests. The teacher provides assessment methods to measure the students' progress via practicing, exercises, and tests. The authors provide assessment methods to measure the students' progress via practicing, exercises, and tests. This necessitates the teacher to have a good grip on the study material, be proficient in technology, and accommodate to the learning setting and student needs. This in turn exemplifies an outstanding teacher. The author possesses the ability to adapt and modify their approach when a lesson is ineffective or has not achieved its objective (Davidson & Uran, 2022). Consequently, it can be inferred that incorporating Youtube vlogging has contributed in improving the students' speaking proficiency.

CONCLUSION

The primary aim of technology in education is to develop media that can facilitate teaching and learning activities in the classroom. In this contemporary era, schools are expected to both adapt to and utilise technology to its fullest potential. According to the results and discussion, the use of YouTube vlogging has proved successful in enhancing the speaking performance skills of students in Class X-E-1. The results indicate a noticeable increase in student scores from the pre-test to the first and second cycles. In the pre-test, students achieved an average score of 50.6% and the class presentation success rate was only 25%, with only 4 out of 20 students meeting the minimum completion criteria, indicating that the success criteria were not met. However, in the first cycle, there was an improvement observed through the use of YouTube vlogging. Eight students, comprising 40% of those evaluated, met the minimum standard of completeness, indicating some progress. In the first cycle, the class average was 65.1%. Despite improvements in speaking performance in this cycle, the criteria for student success remained unfulfilled. Regarding their involvement in the teaching and learning process, the majority of students exhibited limited enthusiasm. During the second cycle, there was a rise in students who achieved above the minimum completion standard, with 17 individuals or 85% surpassing the threshold. Furthermore, the average score among the class also increased to 77.4%. The observation sheet revealed that the teacher was able to enhance their teaching ability while the students appeared attentive, at ease, and displayed improved self-confidence by demonstrating their speaking performance skills. This was observed to be more prevalent in classes that incorporated YouTube vlogging in their teaching and learning activities. Beyond that, teacher reflection on each cycle contributes to the development of broad knowledge about effective ways, such as teaching with particular objectives, adjusting to different learning styles, modifying the lesson, and offering assistance.

The author provides valuable insights to students, teachers, and future researchers through the implementation findings of Youtube vlogging in tenth-grade (X-E-1) students at SMAK St. Gabriel Maumere. It is hoped that students become aware of and willing to explore available technology by maximising smartphones and media in nature, particularly in the context of YouTube vlogging, as technology continues to develop within the field of education.
Hopefully, students will be equipped to actively participate in teaching and learning activities in the classroom, thus becoming motivated to speak English. For EFL teachers, this research can aid in their mastery of using various media as support for the teaching process, and creating a comfortable and pleasant classroom atmosphere. These findings can also serve as references for future researchers interested in speaking teaching using the use of youtube vlogging or similar methods.

REFERENCES


Sileyew, K. J. (2019). Research design and methodology. *Cyberspace, 1*-12. [https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=eqf8DwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA7&ots=cKV55Tlf09&sig=vvWL7SopzLVeXNz8ZHtQXPOnueUU&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=quali&f=false](https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=eqf8DwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA7&ots=cKV55Tlf09&sig=vvWL7SopzLVeXNz8ZHtQXPOnueUU&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=quali&f=false)


This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.